

THE FLYLEAF

PUBLISHED BY THE FRIENDS OF THE FONDREN LIBRARY AT RICE UNIVERSITY HOUSTON, TEXAS



Quarterly October 1969

HERE COME THE JUDGES

The leading article is by David Hamilton Horne, a reprint of his column in the January 1969 issue of Scholarly Books in America, a Quarterly Bibliography of University Press Publications. David Horne received his PhD from Yale University and is now the Associate Editor of the Harvard University Press.

Dr. Horne's career as teacher, scholar, and editor has been a distinguished one. He has written and read many reviews, and in this (no doubt) heartfelt spoof he pays his respects to certain reviewers whom perhaps we have all met. In the final fictitious letter to the editor, though still in the same vein, he lays down a few ground rules for reviewing which really reviews.

This pleasant excursion into parody is here presented with the gracious permission of the author and the publisher.

HERE COME THE JUDGES

by

David Horne

Type I. The Pot and Kettle

I. W. Gronabee, The Parameters of Social Fluxion. Eastern University Press, 346 pp., \$9.75.

The consumption-projection equation cannot be tested by a double-logarithmic-static model, as Gronabee tries to do, and when he says that the biological evidence is in support of the ordered-random-intervals model, he really means the balls-and-boxes model. It would have been more helpful had he used my grape-seeds model, which would have annexed other possibilites not otherwise within its field of relevance.

On the one hand, Gronabee is concerned, within his frame of reference, to show that the entire history of mankind exemplifies a constant anthithesis between what man has tried to be and what he can never be. On the other hand, I have been at pains to prove that the social equation is merely a means of mediating between innovation and conformity. We have here a profound methodological confusion.

Besides which, the price of the book is exorbitant, and the index is inadequate.

Type II. The Smartcracker

Jackie Lee Carbuncle, <u>Positive Incompetence and Negative Capability</u>. Echelon Academy Press, xxi 227 pp., \$6.95.

Miss Carbuncle's novel thesis, which is neither a novel nor a thesis, falls between two elfin grots. Keats, she maintains, would have been a better poet if he had been less gifted. This fantasy will be of negative value to every student of poetry. At least, it doesn't cost much.

Type III. Review of the Author Instead of the Book

Vladimir Astropovic, <u>A Pride of Butterflies</u>, translated by Isaac Hanrahan. Silicon Publishers, 842 pp., \$3.25.

Astropovic has been too little noted and long misunderstood. Through years of patient observation, he gradually learned the language of butterflies. Fellow scientists scorned him because he was self-taught. This very fine volume, bound in laminated Monarch wings, is a tribute to the man who came to believe that butterflies think like people, and whose critics accused him of thinking like a butterfly.

The fifty illustrations are beautiful, but the publisher has placed too high a price on the book.

Type IV. Review of History Instead of the Book

Edgar Hansel, The Longest Parliament of All. Ambrose Peale Technical Institute Press, 441 pp., \$15.00

It is odd that the hitherto neglected "Longest" Parliament has been neglected. Longer than the "Long" Parliament, this one, when it met in 1613, stretched from Westminster across the Thames and into Southwark. Debate was difficult, because only those in the middle could hear what the end benches were saying, and some of these "middle-benchers," or, more properly, "middle boaters," were too busy bailing to hear anything. It is not surprising that the Parliament was prorogued after four hours. The noble experiment was never repeated. The author concludes with a couplet that sums up his thesis:

It is impertinent to smear The work of Lewis B. Namier.

The book is worth every penny of the \$15.00 asked.

Type V. The Cavalry Attack

Stanley Breakwater, The Pollution of Progress. Elgar University Press, 612 pp., \$15.00

What has come to be known as "The Breakwater Solution," advocated by the author in numerous journal and magazine articles over the past decade, is here set forth in detail in a volume the best part of which is its title.

To break a lance with the gray eminence of urban affairs may seem foolhardy, but to re-main silent would be criminal. For the pollution solution of the future, we cannot afford to rely upon awakened public concern, as I have shown elsewhere. Breakwater's basic and fatal miscalculation is that an awakened electorate will force a government to take any action that will increase its taxes. My own contention, which Breakwater stubbornly refuses to accept, is that his solution is composed of one part $\rm H_2O$ and two parts hogwash.

The book is too expensive at any price.

Reference List of Beginnings (Choose One)

Favorable

- 1. The author has brilliantly encapsulated the tensions of Poon County in this handsomely bound, moderately priced book that is a pleasure to look at on the coffee table.
- 2. The value of this stimulating account of the discovery of snail fever lies not so much in the clarity of its language as in its revelation that great scientific discoveries are usually side effects of the common cold.
- 3. The recent appearance of two (three, four, five) books enables us to reconsider the gamut of classical studies.

Unfavorable

- 1. From its title one would suppose this book to deal with the vital Czech origin of Russian Pan-Slavism. The reader will be disappointed, for the book is wholly concerned with yeast molds.
- 2. In this new edition of the works of the Sage of Saugus Junction, the editors have taken such pains with their footnotes that they almost forgot to include the text.
- 3. The donnée of American scholarship is that if one brings enough detail together in one place, it will sort itself into a coherent point of view. The <u>Angst</u> of American scholars is that they have to wait for us English to do it for them.

To the Book Review Editor

Sir: Perhaps the most significant aspect of Jonathan Hedley's review of my Elwood Tuttle: The Early Years is that it has no significant aspect. One cannot escape the feeling that Hedley subscribes to the theory that a review is an occasion for waging a personal vendetta based on professional jealousy.

When a reviewer can't think of any thing else to say, it may appear useful to point out, as Hedley does, that the book is marred by almost a hundred typographical errors. It so happens, however, that I have gone over the pages of Hedley's Elwood Tuttle as Man and Thinker and he has over a hundred errors. Moreover, he has stubbornly failed to make use of the Tuttle Archive at Lambeth Palace, even though he knows how rich a treasure it is.

The cause of scholarship would be better served if reviewers like Hedley would put aside their petty jeal-ousies and devote themselves to five simple questions: (1) What did the author set out to do? (2) Did he succeed in doing it? (3) Was it worth doing? (4) In what particular respects did he succeed? (5) In what particular respects, if any, did he fail?

A review is only one man's opinion invested with the sanctity of type. It stands in print for all the world to read and, without evidence to the contrary, believe. How do we know what prompts the reviewer to write what he writes? Can it be that the author of the book he is judging has beaten him to a lush post at Berkeley? Or is considering him for a \$50,000 appointment at Stony Brook? Or can it be that the reviewer was berated by his wife at breakfast that morning for twitching his nose between each bite of egg?

Of what worth is any review unless we know something of the reviewer's motivation, or unless the author reviewed is also given a chance to be heard? I propose a reform. Book review pages should be divided between two kinds of reviews, those which are short and factual and those which are longer and evaluative. The latter should consist not merely of (1) the reviewer's judgment but also of (2) the author's rejoinder to the review and (3) the reviewer's surrejoinder to the author -- all to be published together in the same place.

This approach is used now, of course, but only by means of letters to the editor, like this one, and time and space separate the review from the rejoinder. We could obtain a clearer understanding of the worth of a book if the method were regularly practiced, and if the review consisted regularly of the three parts. At least, scholars could hear both sides,

and the reviewer might be induced to judge more objectively if he knew that his judgment would not stand unpricked.

As we know, reviews often determine the success or failure of a man's work before it has been widely read. One prejudiced review by a respected expert should not be allowed to damn a person's career. Why should certain ones among us, like Jonathan Hedley, be given power over their peers? He says that I flit from thought to thought, like a hummingbird. Well, I think he's a saprophytic fraud, battening on the intellect of others, and if I could review his book, I would demonstrate what I mean.

Respectfully yours,

H.R.L. Pebbles

MEMORIAL GIFTS

This issue of the FLYLEAF contains the notices of a considerable number of memorial gifts to the Fondren Library, and the attention of the readers is directed to them. All those who make or who have an especial interest in hearing that memorial gifts have been made are of course notified by letter, and suitable volumes bearing memorial plates are selected for the Library. Over the years, hundreds and indeed thousands of valuable acquisitions have come to the Library in this way.

In Memory of	Donor
Bates McFarland Allen	Charles M. Hickey
Mrs. Isaac Arnold	Mr. & Mrs. Albert Bel Fay Mr. & Mrs. David S. Howard, Jr. Mrs. Edward W. Kelley Mr. & Mrs. William A. Kirkland Mr. & Mrs. E. Joe Shimek Mr. & Mrs. I. M. Wilford
Mrs. J. D. Bace	Mrs. Charles Cobler
Mrs. Niven Baird	Curly August Mrs. Theda Darling Mrs. Margaret Dumenil

Mr. & Mrs. John B. Evans

Mary Leatherwood Hugh Lenox Scott

Ida Vick

In Memory of	Donor
Carl C. Barbour	Mrs. Sarale S. Belvedere Charles M. Hickey
Dr. Wayne Bedford	Mr. & Mrs. Damon D. Hickey Doralyn J. Hickey Mrs. Margaret Milby Jarboe Mr. & Mrs. Walter M. Reynolds
Mrs. Lilian Vanpelt Blackwell	Beatrice Y. Harrison Pender Turnbull
Mrs. Murff F. Bledsoe, Jr.	Mr. & Mrs. J. Thomas Eubank, Jr. Mr. & Mrs. John L. Moore
J. B. Bonny	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown
Wayne Franklin Bowman	Mr. & Mrs. Same E. Dunnam
M. Lyle Cashion, Sr.	Mr. & Mrs. Herbert Allen Mr. & Mrs. J. L. Franklin, Jr. Clyde W. Hanks, Jr. Mr. & Mrs. J. Frank Jungman Mr. & Mrs. Robert M. Williams
Mrs. James Chillman	Mrs. Tom W. Bonner Bernard Epstein Mrs. Harry B. Weiser
Mrs. Lucy Milby Clarke	C. A. Dwyer Mr. & Mrs. A. Gordon Jones Mr. & Mrs. Nelson B. Sears Mr. & Mrs. Samuel E. Sims Mr. & Mrs. W. J. Williamson Mr. & Mrs. Frank Zumwalt, Jr.

In Memory of

Donor

Frank Peyton Clay

Eleanor Clay Anderson Margaret Anderson Mrs. L. Larry Mckinley Mrs. L. Polk Williams, Jr.

Mrs. Ella Boyles Clemens Mrs. Vance M. Morton

Gladys Cline

Mrs. Charles Cobler

Roy L. Clouse

Mr. & Mrs. John H. Larson Leland S. Day, Jr. Mr. & Mrs. Charles E. Haas D. M. Keeper Mary Myrick Mr. & Mrs. John M. Schmitz Mr. & Mrs. Ernest L. Vogt, Jr.

Leslie Coleman

Ralph A. Anderson, Jr.
Mrs. Charles Cobler
Mr. & Mrs. H.M. Crosswell, Jr.
Tom M. Davis
The English-Speaking Union
Mr. & Mrs. Albert Bel Fay
Mr. & Mrs. Charles W. Hamilton

Mr. & Mrs. J. Frank Jungman Mrs. Edward W. Kelley

Mr. & Mrs. Curtis McKallip Dr. & Mrs. Dan G. McNamara

Mr. & Mrs. Whitfield H. Marshall

Mr. & Mrs. Thomas W. Moore Mr. & Mrs. Cooper K. Ragan

Mr. & Mrs. H. George Schneider Mr. & Mrs. Radoslav A. Tsanoff

Dr. Hugh C. Welsh

Mr. & Mrs. I. M Wilford

Mr. & Mrs. F. Talbott Wilson

In Memory of	Donor
Hardin Craig, Sr.	Mrs. Tom W. Bonner
Mrs. E. K. Dillingham	Mr. & Mrs. Albert Bel Fay Mrs. W. S. Farish
Cliff Drescher	Mr. & Mrs. Stewart Jamerson
F. Lee Duggan	Mr. & Mrs. T. F. Dupont
Edmund McAshan Dupree	Mrs & Mrs. J. Frank Jungman Mr. & Mrs. Nelson C. Steenland
John C. Edwards	Mr. & Mrs. Alvin S. Moody
Mrs. James A. Elkins	Mr. & Mrs Arthur Benning Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown Mr. & Mrs. Ed Parkes Mr. & Mrs. John F. Staub
Margaret Baird Evans	M. V. McEnany
Mrs. Lena Douglas Ewing	Mrs. Charles Cobler
H. Foley	Mr. & Mrs. J. Thomas Eubank, Jr.
Mrs. George W. Foster	Mrs. Gus Cranz, Jr. Mrs. John H. Foster Mr. & Mrs. Leo S. Shamblin
Mr. & Mrs. E. P. Gerron, Walter Jay, Lucein Kay and Omar Ray Gerron	Mrs. Jewell Daphne Gerron Woodard
Perry A. Gill	Mrs. Charles F. Redmon, Jr.
Dr. John Glen	Dr. Hugh C. Welsh

In Memory of

Dr. Mary Ellen Goodman

Donor

Mr. & Mrs. Daniel Benninghoven Mr. & Mrs. Milton S. Berman Mrs. Bruce J. Biddle Mr. & Mrs. Franz R. Brotzen The Members of Brown College Mr. & Mrs. H. Fletcher Brown Mr. & Mrs. M. F. Carman, Jr. William Caudill Mrs. Mimi G. Cohen Mr. & Mrs. Carey Croneis Mr. & Mrs. W. Kenneth Davis Dr. & Mrs. Charles S. DeJohn Capt. & Mrs. Victor Delano Delta Zeta Sorority, Houston Alumnae Chapter Mr. & Mrs. Frank H. Freed Mr. & Mrs. Fredrick C. Gamst Dr. Doris C. Gilbert Mr. & Mrs. Richard P. Godwin Mr. & Mrs. William E. Gordon Henry Groppe Mrs. Steven Guess Mr. & Mrs. Frank Hole Thomas W. Hopkins, Jr. Houston Bank & Trust Company City of Houston, Comprehensive Planning Division of the City Planning Dept. City of Houston, Model City Dept. Houston Research Institute &

Space Craft, Inc. Mr. & Mrs. Robert H. Kaim The Joseph Kaplan Family

Mr. & Mrs. Burdette W. Keeland,

Foundation

Jr.

In Memory of

Dr. Mary Ellen Goodman (cont'd.)

Donor

Mr. & Mrs. Charles Kelly Mr. & Mrs. Peter Kileff G. A. Lloyd Richard C. Lord Rose McGee Dr. & Mrs. J. L. Margrave Mr. & Mrs. Robert H. Mason T. C. Mock Mr. & Mrs. Edward Norbeck Mr. & Mrs. Stewart Orton Mrs. Doris Hallis Pemberton Charlotte Phelan Mr. & Mrs. Kenneth S. Pitzer Mr. & Mrs. Paul Purser C. C. Ridge Dr. & Mrs. Lawrence R. Rogers Mr. & Mrs. H. E. Rorschach Mr. & Mrs. William H. Rose Mr. & Mrs. Zevi W. Salsburg Deni Seinfeld Robert R. Shrock Mr. & Mrs. Lomis Slaughter Lynn Slaughter Dr. & Mrs. Jack H. Sloan Mr. & Mrs. Howard M. Slutes Dr. & Mrs. Charles F. Squires Mr. & Mrs. Virgil W. Topazio Mr. & Mrs. Radoslav A. Tsanoff Eretha, Drexel, & Leighton Turner United Nations Association, Houston Chapter

Mrs. Ame Vennema

Mr. & Mrs. G. K. Walters Mr. & Mrs. Harvey B. Willard Mr. & Mrs. Marlin Zwicky

In N	<i>lemory</i>	of
------	---------------	----

Mrs. R. Wilbur Goodman

Mrs. James F. Gregg

S. Ross Hardy

Frank E. Hargis

Caroline Louise Harte

Arthur Edward Hartwell

Mrs. Emma Heid

Donor

J. E. Niland

Mr. & Mrs. Carl Illig

Mr. & Mrs. John H. Monroe

Mr. & Mrs. Dan M. Moody

Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown

Mr. & Mrs. A. W. Crawford

Mrs. Raymone T. Barrett Mrs. Ruth Canterbury

Betty Davis Sharon Fischer

Fondren Library Staff

Die Priedrich

Pia Friedrich

Mr. & Mrs. Charles W. Hamilton

Jewel Hamilton

Mr. & Mrs. Harold M. Hyman

Mrs. Florence Jameson

Jean Lindsay

Edith Lorber June McCaskill

Nancy McGeever

Betty Miller

Mr. & Mrs. Richard L. O'Keeffe

Richard H. Perrine

Mrs. Charles F. Redmon, Jr.

Catherine Siever Pender Turnbull

Sue Uhrig June Vermeulen

Theodore R. Heyck Charles M. Hickey Shirley S. Waters

In Memory of	Donor
Theodore R. Heyck (cont'd)	Mr. & Mrs. James L. Whitcomb
Mrs. Reba Hirsch	Mrs. Vance M. Morton
Herbert Hoover, Jr.	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown
Dr. William V. Houston	Mrs. Tom W. Bonner
Mrs. Corrine Ireson	Charles D. O'Brien
Joe R. Jamar	Mr. & Mrs. Alvin Zwerneman
Mrs. Marvin Jones	Mr. & Mrs. Jack C. Pollard
Mrs. Rose Ellen Kohler	Rita Robinton
Melvin E. Kurth	Mr. & Mrs. Henry L. Collier, III
Jack W. Lander	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown Mrs. Edward W. Kelley Mr. & Mrs. H. George Schneider Mr. & Mrs. I. M. Wilford
Hyman Lapin	Mr. & Mrs. Raymond D. Brochstein
rederick Cecil Lawrence	Charles M. Hickey
John S. Lidell	Mr. & Mrs. Mel Anderson, Jr.
Crawford P. Livesay	Mrs. C. B. Mckinney, Sr. Mrs. James A. Schiller
lason Lockwood	Mr. & Mrs. J. Newton Rayzor
oseph Mervin Lycan	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown
lrs. Alice J. McBride	Mr. & Mrs. Harvin C. Moore

In Memory of	Donor
Donald N. McDonnell	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown
N. C. McGowen, Sr.	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown
Newton Kemp Maer	Mr. & Mrs. Alvin S. Moody
David R. Meyer	Mr. & Mrs. A. Lawrence Lennie
Mrs. Annette Hillin Moore	Mr. & Mrs. Harvin C. Moore
Sam A. Morrison	Maud L. Woods
Tarlton Morrow	Mrs. Charles Cobler Dr. Hugh C. Welsh
Mrs. G. R. Morrow	Mr. & Mrs. E. E. Sheffield
Andrew Forest Muir	Mr. & Mrs. William P. Hobby, Jr
Mrs. James K. Nance	E. C. Black Mr. & Mrs. Hubbard S. Caven Mr. & Mrs. J. Thomas Eubank, Jr Mr. & Mrs. Charles W. Hamilton Charles M. Hickey Mr. & Mrs. Richard C. Jarboe Mr. & Mrs. Alvin S. Moody Mr. & Mrs. Roy Nolen Mr. & Mrs. Robert M. Williams
Mrs. A. W. Nichols	Mr. & Mrs. James A. Lunsford
Charlotte Noland	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown
Mrs. Ray Novack	Mr. & Mrs. J. Frank Jungman
Mrs. Fe Phillips	Mr. & Mrs. Dan M. Moody
Alvah Bert Pitts	Mrs. B. J. Kolenda

In Memory of	Donor
Roland Pomerat	Mr. & Mrs. Charles W. Hamilton Richard H. Perrine Mr. & Mrs. J. Newton Rayzor Mr. & Mrs. Radoslav A. Tsanoff Pender Turnbull
Morton W. Potts	Mr. & Mrs. Alvin S. Moody
B. Arthur Quinlan	Mr. & Mrs. Charles R. Tapley
John Robert Randolph	Mr. & Mrs. J. Thomas Eubank, Jr. Mr. & Mrs. John L. Moore
E. Earl Read	Mr. & Mrs. R. E. Cowan, Jr. Mrs. C. H. Neblett Mrs. Robert B. Turner
Alfred L. Reynolds	Mr. & Mrs. Thomas D. Smith
Frank M. Ritchie, Sr.	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown
Nicholas Scauzillo	Mr. & Mrs. Elden Daunoy
Gus A. Schill	Mr. & Mrs. J. Thomas Eubank, Jr.
Christine Schultz	Mr. & Mrs. M. K. Griggs Lola Kennerly Mrs. Luddye K. Michal Mrs. William H. Skipwith Mrs. William B. Torrens Pender Turnbull Mrs. George W. Whiting

Mrs. John Thad Scott, Jr. Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown Mr. & Mrs. J. Frank Jungman

Mrs. Vance M. Morton

In Memory of	Donor
Charles Sells	Mr. & Mrs. R. A. Wright
Emmett Sells	Mr. & Mrs. R. A. Wright
Mrs. Scott Shambaugh	Mrs. C. B. McKinney
Mrs. J. Willis Slaughter	Mrs. G. N. Aldredge Mrs. Arthur Benning Mrs. Margaret B. Bentley Mrs. Wirt Davis Faculty Women's Club of Rice University Mr. & Mrs. B. W. Haughton Mr. & Mrs. John M. Jackson Mrs. Edward W. Kelley Mr. & Mrs. Williams A. Kirkland Mrs. William J. Lewis Mrs. John G. McLaurin Mr. & Mrs. S. I. Morris, Jr. Mr. & Mrs. Edward G. Pearson Mrs. Fred H. Puckhaber Mrs. J. G. Puterbaugh Mrs. J. H. Richardson Mr. & Mrs. John F. Staub Mr. & Mrs. A. Starke Taylor Pender Turnbull Mrs. William Ward Watkin Mrs. Harry B. Weiser
Mary Snoddy	Mrs. William B. Torrens Pender Turnbull Mrs. Ethyl R. Vinson Maud Woods
John Francis Sonnett Edward Soph	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown Charles M. Hickey

In Memory of	Donor
Arthur H. Stevens	Mr. & Mrs. L. A. Hamilton Doralyn J. Hickey Mr. & Mrs. John Mason, Jr. Mrs. Elizabeth Rodell Mr. & Mrs. George G. Williams
Louis William Stiles	Mr. & Mrs. William F. Lovejoy
George W. Strake	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown Mr. & Mrs. Ben F. Love Mr. & Mrs. Alvin S. Moody
Mrs. E. G. Sundt	Mrs. Arthur Boice Mr. & Mrs. J. Thomas Eubank, Jr
Charlotte Taylor	Mr. & Mrs. J. Frank Jungman
Glenn Thompson	Mr. & Mrs. Wiley Anderson Mr. & Mrs. Jack Dickson Mr. & Mrs. Marvin Grace Mr. & Mrs. Bill Hazlett Mr. & Mrs. Jerry Jax Mr. & Mrs. Sidney McClendon
Armin Toelke	Dr. & Mrs. Edward F. Heyne, III
Virginia Von Croy	Mrs. Kem B. Robertson
Thomas Fred Wall, Jr.	Mr. & Mrs. Don Wyatt
Sidney J. Weinberg	Mr. & Mrs. George R. Brown
Mrs. Ida Weison	Mr. & Mrs. Claxton Parks

In Memory of Donor

Fred L. Williams Ralph A. Anderson, Jr.

Mr. & Mrs. George W. Cleveland

Barbara M. Cleveland

Mr. & Mrs. Homer G. Patrick, Jr.

Mrs. John C. Williams Mr. & Mrs. George G. Williams

Fred Wyse Rita Robinton

FRIENDS OF THE FONDREN LIBRARY AT RICE UNIVERSITY

Acting President, Mrs. C. M. Hudspeth Membership Secretary, Mrs. Charles W. Hamilton Treasurer, Charles W. Hamilton

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Mrs. Albert B. Fay J. Frank Jungman Mrs. Ralph D. Looney Frank Vandiver

Hardin Craig, Jr., Editor, the FLYLEAF Raemond Craig, Publication







Mrs. A. H. Stevens 2631 Fenwood Houston, Texas 77005