

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA  
CIVIL MINUTES - EVIDENTIARY HEARING**

Phoenix Division

CV-07-02513-PHX-GMS      DATE: 04/21/2015

Year    Case No.    Dft #

HON: G. Murray Snow

Caption: Manuel de Jesus Ortega Melendres, et al. v. Joseph M. Arpaio, et al.

Deputy Clerk: Nicholas Sommers    Crt Rptr: Gary Moll

Plaintiffs' Attys: Cecillia Wang, Stanley Young, Joshua Bendor, Andre Segura and Daniel Pochoda

Defendants' Attys: Michele Iafrate, Thomas Liddy, Douglas Schwab, Andrew McDonald, Jr., Gary Birnbaum, Lee Stein, Gregory Como and Richard Walker

---

Day #1

9:00 a.m. Counsel are present as stated above. Also present: Attorneys David Eisenberg and Christopher Rapp (special appearances). Chief Robert Warshaw. Deputy Monitors John Girvin and Raul Martinez. Chief Deputy Gerard Sheridan. Defendant Sheriff Joseph M. Arpaio. Without objection, the Court orders Maricopa County as a named party. Attorney Thomas Liddy advises the Court of a conflict that may exist with his continued representation. Due to this possible conflict, Mr. Liddy is excused from counsel table. Preliminary matters discussed. Plaintiffs' counsel invokes the Rule of Exclusion of Witnesses. Trial schedule discussed. Defendants' counsel make an oral motion for a continuance of today's hearing. Motion argued. Motion denied. Plaintiffs' counsel waives opening statement. Defendants' counsel make brief opening statements. **Plaintiffs' case:** Chief David Trombi is sworn and examined. Exhibits 38, 118, and 151 are admitted into evidence. 10:34 a.m. Recess.

10:51 a.m. Court reconvenes. Direct examination of Chief David Trombi continues. Exhibit 119 is admitted into evidence. Cross examination begins. Exhibits 41, 136, 154, and 155 are admitted into evidence. The witness is excused for the lunch hour. Housekeeping matters discussed. 12:08 p.m. Recess.

1:06 p.m. Court reconvenes. Cross examination of Chief David Trombi continues. Exhibits 156, 185, and 189 are admitted into evidence. Redirect examination begins. The Court asks follow-up questions of the witness. Counsel ask follow-up questions on the Court's questions. The witness is excused. Sergeant Brett Palmer is sworn and examined. Exhibit 103 is admitted into evidence. 2:45 p.m. Recess.

3:04 p.m. Court reconvenes. Direct examination of Sergeant Brett Palmer continues. Exhibit 100 is admitted into evidence. Cross examination begins. Redirect examination begins. The Court asks follow-up questions. Counsel ask follow-up questions on the Court's questions. The witness is excused. Chief Brian Sands is sworn and examined. Exhibits 67 and 187 are admitted into evidence. The Court directs the parties to exchange exhibits so that any stipulated exhibits can be admitted in the morning. The Court further directs the parties to exchange a list of witnesses they actually intend to call and email that list to the Court later tonight. Attorney Thomas Liddy advises the Court of his intention to file a motion to withdraw as counsel of record. 5:07 p.m. Court stands in recess until 8:30 a.m. on 04/22/2015.

Time in Court: 6 hrs. 33 mins

Hearing Held: 9:00 a.m. to 5:07 p.m.