EXHIBIT 2: [PROPOSED] SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF TIMOTHY PERLA

1	Jonathan A. Shapiro (257199)	ND DODD II D
2	WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE A 950 Page Mill Road	ND DORK LLP
3	Palo Alto, California 93304	
4	Tel: (650) 858-6101 Fax: (650) 858-6100	
-	jonathan.shapiro@wilmerhale.com	
5	Andrea J. Robinson (pro hac vice)	
6	Timothy J. Perla (pro hac vice)	
7	WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE A 60 State Street	ND DORR LLP
8	Boston, Massachusetts 02109	
9	Tel: (617) 526-6000	
	Fax: (617) 526-5000 andrea.robinson@wilmerhale.com	
10	timothy.perla@wilmerhale.com	
11	Attorneys for Defendant Life Insurance	
12	Company of the Southwest	
13	UNITED STATES	DISTRICT COURT
14	CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA SOUTHERN DIVISION	
15		
	JOYCE WALKER, KIM BRUCE	Case No.: CV 10-9198-JVS(RNBx)
16	HOWLETT, and MURIEL SPOONER, on behalf of themselves and all others	
17	similarly situated,	[PROPOSED] SUPPLEMENTAL
18	Plaintiffs,	DECLARATION OF TIMOTHY PERLA IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS'
19		MOTION FOR CLASS
20	VS.	CERTIFICATION
	LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY OF THE	
21	SOUTHWEST, a Texas corporation, and DOES 1-50	
22		
23	Defendant.	
24	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF TIMOTHY PERLA IN OPPOSITION	

SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF TIMOTHY PERLA IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION, 10-09198-JVS(RNBx)
ActiveUS 101500045v.1

#### 

## 

## 

#### 

### 

## 

# 

## 

#### 

#### 

#### 

#### 

#### 

## 

## 

#### 

## 

## 

## 

### 

#### 

#### **DECLARATION OF TIMOTHY PERLA**

- I, Timothy Perla, declare as follows:
- 1. I am an attorney duly licensed to practice law in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts. I am a Counsel at the law firm of Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP, counsel for Defendant Life Insurance Company of the Southwest ("LSW") in the above-entitled action. I have personal knowledge of the facts stated herein and, if called as a witness, I could and would testify competently thereto.
- 2. On August 24, 2012, I submitted a Declaration concerning the sample of 400 policy files produced in this matter. I conducted a further review of the files in response to Plaintiffs' September 27, 2012 supplemental filing. I now submit the following additional information in support of LSW's supplemental filing in opposition to class certification.
- 3. Policy files sometimes contain an Agent Report. Part 1, Question 7 of the Agent Report asks the agent to "List any sales materials, including illustrations, used relating to the new application." In 33 instances, the response lists only materials other than an illustration, reference to quick calc, or to the IC software. My understanding is that Plaintiffs treated these as agent reports that contained no evidence concerning illustration use. This is incorrect: the question specifically asks about illustration use.
- 4. The Sample contains 491 signed and dated illustrations. In 434 instances (88% of the time), the signature dates falls after the print date. The signature date falls a median of 12 days after the print date.

## Case 2:10-cv-09198-JVS -RNB Document 346-2 Filed 10/02/12 Page 4 of 5 Page ID #:15277

5. The Sample contains 122 illustrations for which the print date precedes or matches application date (less than 31% of the time). Of those, 30 bear a signature date *after* application date.
6. 189 of the 400 policy files in the Sample contain more than one illustration.

I declare under the penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed this 2nd day of October, 2012, at Boston, Massachusetts.

By: <u>/s/ Timothy Perla</u>
Timothy Perla

1

#### PROOF OF SERVICE

2

I am a resident of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, over the age of eighteen years, and not a party to the within action. My business address is Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr LLP, 60 State Street, Boston, Massachusetts 02109. On October 2, 2012, I served the within document(s):

5

6

4

[PROPOSED] SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF TIMOTHY PERLA IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION

7

I placed the document(s) listed above in a sealed envelope with postage thereon fully prepaid, in the United States mail addressed as set forth below.

8

9

I personally caused to be hand delivered the document(s) listed above to the person(s) at the address(es) set forth below.

10

I emailed the document(s) listed above to the person(s) at the address(es) set forth below.

11

I electronically filed the document(s) listed above via the CM/ECF system.

12

13

14

15

16

17

|X|

Brian P. Brosnahan

(bbrosnahan@kasowitz.com)

Charles N. Freiberg

(cfreiberg@kasowitz.com)

Jacob N. Foster

(jfoster@kasowitz.com)

KASOWITZ, BENSON, TORRES & FRIEDMAN LLP

101 California Street, Suite 2300

San Francisco, CA 94111

18

Harvey R. Levine (lsmh@levinelaw.com)

20

19

LEVINE & MILLER
550 West C. Street, Suite 1810

21

San Diego, CA 92101-8596

22

/s/ Joel A. Fleming

23

Joel A. Fleming

24

- 4 -