A. Procedural Background

- 1. On April 2, 2012, Cross-Complainant Oscar Cruz ("Cross-Complainant") filed the Cross-Complaint in this action in the Superior Court of California, San Bernardino County, Case No. CIVRS1201345, ("State Court Action") alleging that Cross-Defendants, Bishop, White, Marshall & Weibel, P.S., Discover Bank and Trans Union, violated the Fair Credit Reporting Act 15 U.S.C. §§ 1681, *et seq.* A complete and accurate copy of the Cross-Complaint, and complete and accurate copies of pleadings filed to date in the State Court Action are attached hereto as **Exhibit A**¹.
- 2. The time period for filing a responsive pleading in the State Court Action has not expired as of the filing of this Notice of Removal.
- 3. The Cross-Defendants were served with Cross-Complainant's Cross-Complaint on the following dates: Trans Union, Bishop, White, Marshall & Weibel, P.S. and Discover Bank were served on April 4, 2012. This Notice of Removal is being filed within the thirty (30) day time period required by 28 U.S.C. §1446(b). Complete and accurate copies of the Cross-Defendants' Joinders and Consents to Removal are attached collectively hereto as **Exhibit B**.

B. Grounds for Removal

4. The present suit is an action over which this Court has original jurisdiction pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 and may be removed to this Court by Cross-Defendant pursuant to the provisions of 28 U.S.C. § 1441(b), as it is a civil action founded on a claim or right arising under the laws of the United States. Removal is thus proper because Cross-Complainant's claims present a federal question. *Id.* In the face of the Cross-Complaint and the documents attached to the Cross-Complaint, Cross-Complainant seeks damages for Cross-Defendants' alleged violations of the Federal Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1681 *et seq.* Moreover, any future claims based on state law may be adjudicated by this

¹ We will supplement Exhibit A with a complete copy of the State Court record upon receipt from the Superior Court of California, San Bernardino County.

Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1367. Additionally, a court has authority to remove when a claim made against a third-party is truly a separate and independent claim, which would be removable on its own right. Carl Heck Engineers, Inc. v. Lafourche Parish Police Jury (5th Cir. 1980) 622 F2d 133, 135-136; see ¶ 2:808 ff. Furthermore, third-party defendants should not be deprived of their right to remove by the procedural accident that they were joined on a third party basis, rather than as defendants originally. Motor Vehicle Cas. Co. v. Russian River County Sanitation Dist. (ND CA 1981) 538 F.Supp. 488, 491-492. Accordingly, removal in the third-party context is proper.

C. Compliance with Procedural Requirements

- 5. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1446(b), this Notice is being filed with this Court within thirty (30) days after the Cross-Defendant received a copy of Cross-Complainants initial pleading setting forth the claims for relief upon which Cross-Complainants action is based.
- 6. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1441(a), venue of the removal action is proper in this Court because it is in the district and division embracing the place where the state court action is pending.
- 7. Promptly after the filing of this Notice of Removal, Trans Union shall give written notice of the removal to Cross-Complainant and will file a copy of this Notice of Removal with the Clerk of the Superior Court of the State of California, County of San Bernardino, as required by 28 U.S.C. § 1446(d).
- 8. No other proceedings, process, pleadings, orders or other paper have been filed or served in the State Court Action. Trial has not commenced in Superior Court of California, San Bernardino County, Case No. CIVRS1201345.
- 9. By filling this Notice of Removal, Trans Union consents to the removal of this case.

CROSS-DEFENDANT TRANS UNION LLC'S NOTICE OF REMOVAL

Case \$:12-cv-00711-VAP-SP Document 1 Filed 05/04/12 Page 4 of 10 Page ID #:106

Case	5:12-cv-00711-VAP-SP Document 1 Filed 05/04/12 Page 6 of 10 Page ID #:108
1	SERVICE LIST
2	Robert A. Weiner, Esq. Jerry Yalon
3	rawlaw@brennanlaw.com BRENNAN, WEINER & bishop, white, marshall & weibel, P.S. 901 sunvalley blvd, suite 220
4	ASSOCIATES, A.P.C concord, CA 94520
5	3150 Montrose Avenue (877) 259-1016 La Crescenta, California 91214 Attorney for Bishop, White, Marshall &
6	Telephone: (818) 249-5291 <i>Weibel, P.S. and Discover Bank</i> Facsimile: (818) 249-4329
7	Attorney for Oscar Cruz
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
	6
	CROSS-DEFENDANT TRANS UNION LLC'S NOTICE OF REMOVAL

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

NOTICE OF ASSIGNMENT TO UNITED STATES MAGISTRATE JUDGE FOR DISCOVERY

This case has been assigned to District Judge Virginia A. Phillips and the assigned discovery Magistrate Judge is Sheri Pym.

The case number on all documents filed with the Court should read as follows:

EDCV12- 711 VAP (SPx)

Pursuant to General Order 05-07 of the United States District Court for the Central District of California, the Magistrate Judge has been designated to hear discovery related motions.

A	all discovery related motion	s shou	ald be noticed on the calendar	of th	e Magistrate Judge
=	========	==:		==	
			NOTICE TO COUNSEL		
	opy of this notice must be served I, a copy of this notice must be se		e summons and complaint on all de n all plaintiffs).	fendal	nts (if a removal action is
Sub	sequent documents must be filed	at the	following location:		
L	Western Division 312 N. Spring St., Rm. G-8 Los Angeles, CA 90012	L	Southern Division 411 West Fourth St., Rm. 1-053 Santa Ana, CA 92701-4516	[X]	Eastern Division 3470 Twelfth St., Rm. 134 Riverside, CA 92501

Failure to file at the proper location will result in your documents being returned to you.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA CIVIL COVER SHEET

It. BASIS OF JURISDICTION (Place an X in one box only.)	1 (a) PLAINTIFFS (Check bo Oscar Cruz	x if you are representing yourself [])	DEFENDANTS BISHOP, WHITE, MAR TRANSUNION LLC. AN			OVER BANK;	
Clize an X in one box for plaintiff and one for defendant, Clize not flus state Clize	yourself, provide same.)	ddress and Telephone Number. If yo	ou are representing	•				
Clize of This State	II. BASIS OF JURISDICTIO	N (Place an X in one box only.)					ly	
IV. ORIGIN (Place an X in one box only.)	☐ I U.S. Government Plaintiff			PT	F DEF	ncorporated or Princ	ipal Place 4	
IV. ORIGIN (Place an X in one box only.)	☐ 2 U.S. Government Defendan				of	Business in Anothe		□ 5
District Proceeding District Proceeding District Proceeding District Dis	IV ORIGIN (Place an X in on	e boy only)	Citizen or Subje	ct of a Poreign Country [1]	U3 F	oreign Nation	<u> </u>	□6
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION (Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing and write a brief statement of cause. Do not cite jurisdictional statutes unless diversity) 15 U.S.C. § 1681 et seq.; Federal Fair Credit Reporting Act VII. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an X is one box only.) OTHER STATUTES 400 State Reapportionment 410 Antitrust 410 Antitrust 410 Antitrust 410 Recovery of Departation 470 Commerce/ICC 410 Deportation 470 Recketer Influenced and Corrupt 470 Corporation 470 Consumer Credit 480 Consumer Credit 490 Commercer Credit 490 Consumer Credit 490 Consumer Credit 490 Consumer Credit 490 Consumer Credit 490 State Statutory Actions 591 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange 870 Cotes Statutory Actions 871 Statutory Actions 871 Customer Challenge 12 872 Customer Challenge 12 873 Customer Challenge 12 874 Consumer Credit 875 Customer Challenge 12 875 Customer Chall	☐ 1 Original 2 Remove	ed from 3 Remanded from 0	4 Reinstated or 5 Reopened	Transferred from another di	strict (specif	District	Judge from	
VII. NATURE OF SUIT (Place an X to one box only.) OTHER STATUTES 400 State Reapportionment 110 Insurance 130 Miller Act 130 Mill	•		-	•	•	T: \$		
OTHER STATUTES			you are filing and writ	te a brief statement of cause.	Do not cite j	urisdictional statute	s unless diversity.)	
100 State Reapportionment	VII. NATURE OF SUIT (Place	e an X in one box only.)						
	□ 400 State Reapportionment □ 410 Antitrust □ 430 Banks and Banking □ 450 Commerce/ICC Rates/etc. □ 460 Deportation □ 470 Racketeer Influenced and Corrupt Organizations □ 480 Consumer Credit □ 490 Cable/Sat TV □ 810 Selective Service □ 850 Securities/Commodities/ Exchange □ 875 Customer Challenge 12 USC 3410 □ 890 Other Statutory Actions □ 891 Agricultural Act □ 892 Economic Stabilization Act □ 893 Environmental Matters □ 894 Energy Allocation Act □ 895 Freedom of Info. Act □ 890 Appeal of Fee Determination Under Equal Access to Justice □ 950 Constitutionality of	□ 110 Insurance □ 120 Marine □ 130 Miller Act □ 140 Negotiable Instrument □ 150 Recovery of □ Overpayment & □ Enforcement of □ Judgment □ 151 Medicare Act □ 152 Recovery of Defaulted □ Student Loan (Excl. □ Veterans) □ 153 Recovery of □ Overpayment of □ Veteran's Benefits □ 160 Stockholders' Suits □ 190 Other Contract □ 195 Contract Product □ Liability □ 196 Franchise □ REAL PROPERTY □ 210 Land Condemnation □ 220 Foreclosure □ 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment □ 245 Tort Product Liability □ 290 All Other Real Property	PERSONAL INJURY 310 Airplane 315 Airplane Product Liability 320 Assault, Libel & Slander 330 Fed. Employers' Liability 340 Marine 345 Marine Product Liability 350 Motor Vehicle Product Liability 360 Other Personal Injury-Med Malpractice 362 Personal Injury-Product Liability 368 Asbestos Person Injury Product Liability 368 Asbestos Person Injury Product Liability 369 MMIGRATION 360 Naturalization Application 361 Asbestos Person Injury Product Liability 361 MMIGRATION 362 MMIGRATION 363 Asbestos Person Injury Product Liability 364 Asbestos Person Injury Product Liability 365 MMIGRATION 366 Asbestos Person Injury Product Liability 367 MMIGRATION 368 Asbestos Person Injury Product Liability 369 MMIGRATION 360 Other Immigration 361 Airplane 362 Product Liability 363 Airplane 364 Asignature 365 Other Immigration 366 Other Immigration	PERSONAL PROPERTY 370 Other Fraud 371 Truth in Lending 380 Other Personal Property Damage 385 Property Damage 385 Property Damage 422 Appeal 28 USC 158 422 Appeal 28 USC 157 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 CIVIL RIGHTS 441 Voting 442 Employment 443 Housing/Accommodations 444 Welfare 445 American with Disabilities - Employment 446 American with Disabilities - Other 440 Other Civil Rights	PET PST PST	ITTONS otions to leate Sentence beas Corpus neral anth Penalty andamus/ her vil Rights son Condition ETTURE/ viALTY riculture her Food & liguer Laws R. & Truck rline Regs cupational fety /Health her 8	10 Fair Labor Stan Act 20 Labor/Mgmt. Relations 30 Labor/Mgmt. Reporting & Disclosure Act 40 Railway Labor Litigation 91 Empl. Ret. Inc. Security Act PROPERTY RIGHT 20 Copyrights 30 Copyrights 40 Trademark SOCIAL SECURIT 61 HIA (1395ff) 62 Black Lung (92:63 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) 63 RSI (405(g)) 64 RSI (405(g)) 65 RSI (405(g)) 65 PRALTAX SUI 70 Taxes (U.S. Plai or Defendant) 71 IRS-Third Party	Act TS 3) Intiff

FOR OFFICE USE ONLY: Case Number:

AFTER COMPLETING THE FRONT SIDE OF FORM CV-71, COMPLETE THE INFORMATION REQUESTED BELOW.

SPX

MAY -4 2012

Case 5:12-cv-00711-VAP-SP Document 1 Filed 05/04/12 Page 9 of 10 Page ID #:111

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA CIVIL COVER SHEET

VIII(a). IDENTICAL CASES: Ha If yes, list case number(s):	s this action been p	reviously filed in this court ar	nd dismissed, remanded or closed? No Yes	
VIII(b). RELATED CASES: Hav If yes, list case number(s):	e any cases been pro	eviously filed in this court that	at are related to the present case? Ve No Yes	
□ C.	Arise from the sam Call for determinate For other reasons w	e or closely related transaction of the same or substantial yould entail substantial duplic	ons, happenings, or events; or ly related or similar questions of law and fact; or cation of labor if heard by different judges; or , <u>and</u> one of the factors identified above in a, b or c al	lso is present.
IX. VENUE: (When completing the	following informat	ion, use an additional sheet i	f necessary.)	
			if other than California; or Foreign Country, in which this box is checked, go to item (b).	EACH named plaintiff resides.
County in this District:*			California County outside of this District; State, if oth	er than California; or Foreign Country
San Bernardino				
			f other than California; or Foreign Country, in which If this box is checked, go to item (c).	EACH named defendant resides.
County in this District:*			California County outside of this District; State, if oth	
			Bishop, White, Marshall & Weibel, P.S Cor Discover Bank - Illinois Trans Union LLC - Illinois	ntra Costa County, California
(c) List the County in this District; Note: In land condemnation			f other than California; or Foreign Country, in which ved.	EACH claim arose.
County in this District:*			California County outside of this District; State, if oth	er than California; or Foreign Country
San Bernardino				
* Los Angeles, Orange, San Bernar Note: In land condemnation cases, us			San Luis Obispo Counties	
X. SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY (OR PRO PER):		Date 5-1	4-12
Notice to Counsel/Parties: The or other papers as required by law	ne CV-71 (JS-44) v. This form, approv	ed by the Judicial Conference	mation contained berein neither replace nor suppleme e of the United States in September 1974, is required p ing the civil docket sheet. (For more detailed instruct	oursuant to Local Rule 3-1 is not filed
Key to Statistical codes relating to So	cial Security Cases:			
Nature of Suit Code	Abbreviation	Substantive Statement of	Cause of Action	
861	HIA		ance benefits (Medicare) under Title 18, Part A, of the spitals, skilled nursing facilities, etc., for certification (FF(b))	3 ,
862	BL	All claims for "Black Lung (30 U.S.C. 923)	g" benefits under Title 4, Part B, of the Federal Coal	Mine Health and Safety Act of 1969.
863	DIWC	-	workers for disability insurance benefits under Title iled for child's insurance benefits based on disability.	2 .
863	DIWW	All claims filed for widow Act, as amended. (42 U.S.	s or widowers insurance benefits based on disability $(C.405(g))$	under Title 2 of the Social Security
864	SSID	All claims for supplementa Act, as amended.	al security income payments based upon disability file	ed under Title 16 of the Social Security
865	RSI	All claims for retirement (old age) and survivors benefits under Title 2 of the So	ocial Security Act, as amended. (42

CV-71 (05/08) CIVIL COVER SHEET Page 2 of 2

U.S.C. (g))

$2 \parallel$	DISCOVED DANIZ	Casa Na
$3 \parallel^{1}$	DISCOVER BANK,	Case No.
4 ,	Plaintiff,	
5	v. OSCAR CRUZ, an individual; and	ATTACHMENT TO CIVIL COVER SHEET
/ II	DOES 1-10, inclusive,	
7	Defendants;	
}		
) (OSCAR CRUZ, an individual	
)	Cross-complainant,	
\	v.	
·	BISHOP, WHITE, MARSHALL &	
. 11	WEIBEL, P.S.; DISCOVER BANK; FRANSUNION LLC. AND ROES 1-25,	
11	INCLUSIVE	
5	Cross-Defendants.	
, - ,		
' <u>r</u>	Robert A. Weiner, Esq. <u>rawlaw@brennanlaw.com</u>	Donald E. Bradley (State Bar No. 145037) d.bradley@mpglaw.com
) [[BRENNAN, WEINER & ASSOCIATES, A.P.C	MUSICK, PEELER & GARRETT LLP 650 Town Center Drive, Suite 1200
, ,,	3150 Montrose Avenue La Crescenta, California 91214	Costa Mesa, CA 92626-1925
) 1	Telephone: (818) 249-5291	Telephone: (714) 668-2400 Facsimile: (714) 668-2490
11	Facsimile: (818) 249-4329 Attorney for Cross-Complainant	Attorney for Defendant Trans Union LLC (incorrectly named TRANSUNION)
2		
	erry Yalon Bishop, White, Marshall & Weibel, P.S.	
. 9	901 Sunvalley Blvd, Suite 220	
	Concord, CA 94520 Felephone: (877) 259-1016	
11	Attorney for Cross-Defendants Bishop, White, Marshall & Weibel, P.S.; and	
*	Discover Bank	