UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA
NORFOLK DIVISION

I/P ENGINE, INC.

     Plaintiff,

    v.   Civil Action No. 2:11-cv-512

AOL INC., *et al.*,

     Defendants.

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO SEAL (1) PORTIONS OF THE
DECLARATION OF KRISTIN ZMRHAL IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANTS'
OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE SUPPLEMENTAL
MEMORANDUM REGARDING MOTION TO SHOW CAUSE; (2) PORTIONS OF
EXHIBITS 6-8 TO THE DECLARATION OF JOSHUA L. SOHN IN SUPPORT
THEREOF; AND (3) EXHIBITS 9-10 TO THE DECLARATION OF JOSHUA L. SOHN
IN SUPPORT THEREOF**

In support of their Motion to Seal pursuant to Local Rule 5, and the Protective Order

entered in this matter on January 23, 2012 (Doc. No. 85), Defendants Google Inc., Target

Corporation, IAC Search & Media, Inc., Gannett Co., Inc. and AOL Inc. (collectively

"Defendants") state the following:

1.   Defendants have moved the court for leave to file under seal (1) Portions of the

Declaration of Kristin Zmrhal in Support of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for

Leave to File Supplemental Memorandum Regarding Motion to Show Cause ("Portions of the

Zmrhal Declaration"); (2) Portions of Exhibits 6-8 to the Declaration of Joshua L. Sohn in

Support of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Leave to File Supplemental

Memorandum Regarding Motion to Show Cause and Motion to Strike Plaintiff's Supplemental

Memorandum ("Portions of Exhibits 6-8 to the Sohn Declaration"); and (3) Exhibits 9-10 to the

Declaration of Joshua L. Sohn in Support of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Leave to File Supplemental Memorandum Regarding Motion to Show Cause and Motion to Strike Plaintiff's Supplemental Memorandum ("Exhibits 9-10 to the Sohn Declaration").

2.   Portions of the Zmrhal Declaration, Portions of Exhibits 6-8 to the Sohn Declaration and Exhibits 9-10 to the Sohn Declaration contain data that is confidential under the Protective Order.

3.   There are three requirements for sealing court filings: (1) public notice with an opportunity to object; (2) consideration of less drastic alternatives; and (3) a statement of specific findings in support of a decision to seal and rejecting alternatives to sealing. *See, e.g., Flexible Benefits Council v. Feldman*, No. 1:08-CV-371, 2008 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 93039 (E.D. Va. Nov. 13, 2008) (citing *Ashcraft v. Conoco, Inc.,* 218 F.3d 282, 288 (4th Cir. 2000)). Defendants contend that Portions of the Zmrhal Declaration, Portions of Exhibits 6-8 to the Sohn Declaration and Exhibits 9-10 to the Sohn Declaration contain data that is confidential under the Protective Order. Defendants specifically state as reasons for sealing the requested pleadings that they contain highly confidential business and trade secret information, all of which is not generally known, has economic value, and the disclosure of which would cause competitive harm if made widely public.

Defendants have made all reasonable efforts to narrowly limit their redactions in compliance with the law of this Circuit.

4.   *In camera* copies of Portions of the Zmrhal Declaration, Portions of Exhibits 6-8 to the Sohn Declaration and Exhibits 9-10 to the Sohn Declaration have been forwarded to the Court.

5.   By filing narrowly redacted public pleadings, the Defendants have made all reasonable efforts to limit their redactions in compliance with the law of this Circuit.

6.   For the sake of consistency with practices governing the case as a whole, Portions of the Zmrhal Declaration, Portions of Exhibits 6-8 to the Sohn Declaration and Exhibits 9-10 to the Sohn Declaration should remain sealed and be treated in accordance with the terms and conditions of the Protective Order.

Accordingly, and in satisfaction of the requirements of Local Rule 5, Defendants respectfully ask the Court to seal Portions of the Zmrhal Declaration, Portions of Exhibits 6-8 to the Sohn Declaration and Exhibits 9-10 to the Sohn Declaration.

DATED: October 21, 2013   /s/ Stephen E. Noona
                                                 Stephen E. Noona
                                                 Virginia State Bar No. 25367
                                                 KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C.
                                                 150 West Main Street, Suite 2100
                                                 Norfolk, VA 23510
                                                 Telephone: (757) 624-3000
                                                 Facsimile: (757) 624-3169
                                                 senoona@kaufcan.com

                                                 David Bilsker
                                                 David A. Perlson
                                                 QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &
                                                   SULLIVAN, LLP
                                                 50 California Street, 22nd Floor
                                                 San Francisco, California 94111
                                                 Telephone: (415) 875-6600
                                                 Facsimile: (415) 875-6700
                                                 davidbilsker@quinnemanuel.com
                                                 davidperlson@quinnemanuel.com

                                                 Counsel for Google Inc., Target Corporation,
                                                 IAC Search & Media, Inc., and Gannett Co., Inc.

                                                 /s/ Stephen E. Noona

Stephen E. Noona
Virginia State Bar No. 25367
KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C.
150 W. Main Street, Suite 2100
Norfolk, VA 23510
Telephone: (757) 624-3000
Facsimile: (757) 624-3169
senoona@kaufcan.com

Robert L. Burns
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW, GARRETT &
DUNNER, LLP
Two Freedom Square
11955 Freedom Drive
Reston, VA 20190
Telephone: (571) 203-2700
Facsimile: (202) 408-4400

Cortney S. Alexander
FINNEGAN, HENDERSON, FARABOW, GARRETT &
DUNNER, LLP
3500 SunTrust Plaza
303 Peachtree Street, NE
Atlanta, GA 94111
Telephone: (404) 653-6400
Facsimile: (415) 653-6444

Counsel for Defendant AOL Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on October 21, 2013, I will electronically file the foregoing with the

Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send a notification of such filing (NEF) to

the following:

Jeffrey K. Sherwood
Kenneth W. Brothers
DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO LLP
1825 Eye Street NW
Washington, DC   20006
Telephone: (202) 420-2200
Facsimile: (202) 420-2201
sherwoodj@dicksteinshapiro.com
brothersk@dicksteinshapiro.com

Donald C. Schultz
W. Ryan Snow
Steven Stancliff
CRENSHAW, WARE & MARTIN, P.L.C.
150 West Main Street, Suite 1500
Norfolk, VA 23510
Telephone: (757) 623-3000
Facsimile: (757) 623-5735
dschultz@cwm-law.cm
wrsnow@cwm-law.com
sstancliff@cwm-law.com

Counsel for Plaintiff, I/P Engine, Inc.

 /s/ Stephen E. Noona
Stephen E. Noona
Virginia State Bar No. 25367
KAUFMAN & CANOLES, P.C.
150 West Main Street, Suite 2100
Norfolk, VA 23510
Telephone: (757) 624-3000
Facsimile: (757) 624-3169
senoona@kaufcan.com

12745853v1