Case 2:11-cv-00512-RAJ-TEM Document 920 Filed 04/05/13 Page 1 of 10 PageID# 22982

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF VIRGINIA NORFOLK DIVISION

FILED		
	APR - 5 2013	
CLERK, US DISTRICT COURT NOPFOLK, VA		

I/P ENGINE, INC.

Plaintiff,

Civil Action No. 2:11-cv-512

v.

AOL, INC., et al.,

Defendants.

AMENDED ORDER REGARDING PARTIES' JOINT RESPONSE TO THE COURT'S ORDER REGARDING OUTSTANDING MOTIONS TO SEAL CASE DOCUMENTS

On this day came the parties, I/P Engine, Inc. ("Plaintiff") and AOL Inc., Gannett Co.,

Inc., Google Inc., IAC Search & Media, Inc., and Target Corporation (collectively

"Defendants"), by counsel, pursuant to this Court's Order Regarding Outstanding Motions to

Seal Case Documents (ECF No. 886) ("Order Regarding Outstanding Motions to Seal"), and the

Parties' Joint Response to the Court's Order Regarding Outstanding Motions to Seal (the

"Response"), and after consideration of that Response and arguments in support of that

Response, and for good cause shown, it is:

ORDERED THAT:

1. The following pending motions to seal are **DEEMED** moot and therefore

withdrawn:

Docket Number	Motion Name
355	MOTION to Seal Exhibit 1 to its Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff I/P Engines Daubert Motion, and Fourth Motion in Limine, to Exclude Lyle Ungar's New Theory of Invalidity and Opinions Regarding Claim Construction
346, 412	MOTION to Seal Documents and Close the Courtroom During

	Presentation of Confidential Material at Trial Joint MOTION to Amend/Correct 346 MOTION to Seal Documents and Close the Courtroom During Presentation of Confidential Material at Trial Joint Motion and Memorandum in Support of Joint Motion To Amend/Modify Scheduling Order to Provide Briefing Schedule for Motion
	to Seal and Close Courtroom
436	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Opposition to Defendants' Motion in Limine #1 along with Exhibits 5-6 and 11-12
514	MOTION to Seal Exhibits 1 and 2 to its Response to Defendants Motion to Seal Documents and Close the Courtroom During Presentation of Confidential Materials at Trial
687	MOTION to Seal Portions of the Order on the Final Pretrial Conference

The Clerk is instructed to return to the parties all previously filed materials relating to these

withdrawn motions.

2. Based upon the parties' joint representations that there are no objections, the

following motions to seal are **GRANTED**:

Docket Number	Motion Name
280	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Second Motion for
	Discovery Sanctions Regarding Untimely Discovery Responses
	along with Exhibits 2, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 13, and 14 in support
289, 368	MOTION to Seal [CORRECTED MOTION] Memorandum in
(Corrected D.N. 285)	Support of Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Third Motion for Discovery
	Sanctions Regarding Untimely Discovery Responses along with
	Exhibits 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, in support
	Sealed Memorandum in Support of THIRD 285 MOTION to Seal
	Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Third
	Motion for Discovery Sanctions Regarding Untimely Discovery
	Responses along with Exhibits 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, in support
296	MOTION to Seal Portions of Defendants' Memorandum in Support
	of Motion in Limine No. 3 to Exclude Marketing and High-Level
	Non-Technical Matters Related to Historical Click-Through Rate,
	and Exhibits F, H, I and J to the Declaration of Joshua L. Sohn in
	Support of the Defendants' Various Motions in Limine
312	MOTION to Seal Exhibit 3 to the Memorandum in Support of
	Plaintiff I/P Engine's First Motion in Limine to Exclude
	Inadmissible Evidence
316	MOTION to Seal Portions of Memorandum in Support of
	Defendants' Motion to Exclude Testimony from Stephen L. Becker

	1 On this Materials Eiled in Support Thereof		
	and Certain Materials Filed in Support Thereof		
324	MOTION to Seal Portions of Memorandum in Support of		
	Defendants' Motion to Preclude Dr. Ophir Frieder from Testifying		
	Regarding Untimely Opinions that were Not Disclosed in his		
	Original Expert Report and Opinions that he Now Concedes are		
	Incorrect, and Certain Materials Filed in Support Thereof		
331	MOTION to Seal the Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff I/P		
	Engine, Inc.'s Second Motion in Limine to Preclude Non-		
	Comparable License Agreements along with Exhibits 1 and 2		
338	MOTION to Seal the Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff I/P		
	Engine, Inc.'s Motion to Exclude Opinions and Testimony of Keith		
	R. Ugone along with Exhibits 1 and 2		
343	MOTION to Seal Portions of the Declaration of Michael Hochberg		
	in Support of Plaintiff's and Defendants' Motions to Seal		
425	MOTION to Seal its Opposition to Defendants Motion for		
	Summary Judgment along with Exhibits 8, 11-19, 22-24, 27-32, 34-		
	39, 45, 53-54, 56		
429	MOTION to Seal (1) Portions of Defendants' Opposition to		
	Plaintiff I/P Engine's First Motion in Limine to Exclude		
	Inadmissible Evidence; (2) Portions of Defendants' Opposition to		
	Plaintiff I/P Engine's Second Motion in Limine to Preclude License		
	Agreements, and (3) Exhibits E and K to the Declaration of		
	Margaret P. Kammerud in Support of Defendants' Opposition to		
	Plaintiff's Motions in Limine		
441	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Opposition to		
	Defendants' Motion in Limine #2 along with Exhibits 1 and 2		
445	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Opposition to		
	Defendants' Motion in Limine #3 along with Exhibits 3-11		
449	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Opposition to		
	Defendants' Motion in Limine #4 along with Exhibits 1 and 2		
453	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Opposition to		
	Defendants' Motion in Limine #5 along with Exhibits 1 and 2		
457	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Opposition to		
	Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Stephen L.		
	Becker along with Exhibits 1-5, 7-8, and 10-11		
462	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Opposition to		
	Defendants Motion to Preclude Dr. Frieder from Testifying		
	Regarding Untimely Opinions along with Exhibits 1-3 and 5		
465	MOTION to Seal Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Their		
	Opposition to Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Motion to Exclude		
	Opinions and Testimony of Keith R. Ugone		
508	MOTION to Seal (1) Portions of Defendants' Opposition to		
	Plaintiff's Daubert Motion, and Fourth Motion in Limine, to		
	Exclude Lyle Ungar's New Theory of Invalidity and Opinions		
	Regarding Claim Construction and (2) Exhibits 10 and 12 to the		
	Declaration of Howard Chen in Support of Defendants'		
1			

	Memorandum in Opposition to Plaintiff's Daubert Motion, and
	Memorandum in Opposition to Flaminin's Dauger's New Theory of
	Fourth Motion in Limine, to Exclude Lyle Ungar's New Theory of
	Invalidity and Opinions Regarding Claim Construction
517	MOTION to Seal (1) Portions of Defendants' Memorandum in
	Opposition to Plaintiff's Second Motion for Discovery Sanctions;
	(2) Portions of Defendants' Memorandum in Opposition to
	Plaintiff's Third Motion for Discovery Sanctions; (3) Portions of
	the Declaration of Margaret Kammerud in Support of Defendants'
	Opposition to Plaintiff's Third Motion for Discovery Sanctions; (4)
	Portions of Exhibits A-E, G, I-K to the Declaration of Jennifer
	Ghaussy in Support of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Second
	Motion for Discovery Sanctions; and (5) Exhibits L-Q to the
	Declaration of Margaret Kammerud in Support of Defendants'
	Opposition to Plaintiff's Third Motion for Discovery Sanctions
	Opposition to Plantin S Tind Wotion for Discovery Saletions
524	MOTION to Seal Portions of the Reply in Support of Defendants'
	Motion for Summary Judgment, and Exhibits 34 and 36 to the
	Declaration of Joshua L. Sohn in Support of Defendants' Reply in
	Support of Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment
561	MOTION to Seal (1) Portions of Defendants' Reply Brief in
	Support of Their Motion to Preclude Dr. Ophir Frieder from
	Testifying Regarding Untimely Opinions that were not Disclosed in
	his Original Expert Report and Opinions that he Now Concedes are
	Incorrect; (2) Portions of Defendants' Reply Brief in Support of
	their Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Stephen L. Becker; and
	(3) Portions of Exhibit I to the Declaration of Howard Chen in
	Support of Defendants' Reply Brief in Support of their Motion to
	Preclude Dr. Ophir Frieder
	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Reply in Further
567	MOTION to Sear Plaintin I/F Elignic, inc. S Keply in Future
	Support of its Motion to Exclude Opinions and Testimony of Keith
	R. Ugone along with Exhibits 1-3
647	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Reply in Further
	Support of its Third Motion for Discovery Sanctions along with
	Exhibits 1 and 2
684	MOTION to Seal Exhibits 1 and 4 to its Opposition to Defendants
	Motion to Dismiss All Claims Against AOL, Inc., Gannett Co.,
	Inc., IAC Search & Media, Inc., and Target Corporation
706	MOTION to Seal Portions Of Exhibit 1 To The O'Brien
	Declaration In Support Of Defendants Motion For Sanctions And
	To Strike Portions Of Dr. Frieder's Second Updated Expert Report
802	MOTION to Seal and Redact Portions of Trial Record
	MOTION to Seal (1) Portions Of Defendants Memorandum In
828	Support Of Renewed Motion For Judgment As A Matter Of Law
	On Non-Infringement Or New Trial; (2) Portions Of Defendants'
	On Non-Intringement Of Denswed Motion For Judgment As A
	Memorandum In Support Of Renewed Motion For Judgment As A
	Matter Of Law On Damages Or New Trial; And (3) Certain Exhibit
	To The Declaration Of Joshua L. Sohn In Support Of Defendants

	Renewed Motions For Judgment As A Matter Of Law On Damages, Invalidity And Non-Infringement Or New Trial
866	MOTION to Seal Portions of Defendants' Memorandum in Opposition to Plaintiff's Rule 59 Motion for a New Trial on the Dollar Amount of Damages and Exhibit 2 to the Declaration of Margaret P. Kammerud Filed in Support Thereof
873	MOTION to Seal Plaintiff I/P Engine, Inc.'s Opposition to Defendants Renewed Motion for Judgment as a Matter of Law on Non-Infringement or New Trial

3. Based upon the parties' joint representations, the following individual materials

subject to the motions to seal can be filed publicly and thus the motions are **DENIED**:

Docket Number of Motion to Be Ruled Upon	Docket Number of Document at Issue	Document Description
280	278, 342	Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Second motion for Sanctions
280	278-14, 366	Exhibit 14 to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Second motion for Sanctions
289, 368 (Corrected D.N. 285)	283	Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Third Motion for Sanctions
289, 368 (Corrected D.N. 285)	283-4, 370	Exhibit 4 to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Third Motion for Sanctions
289, 368 (Corrected D.N. 285)	283-5, 371	Exhibit 5 to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Third Motion for Sanctions
296	304, 380	Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Motion in Limine 3
296	310-6, 381	Exhibit F to Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Motion in Limine 3
296	310-8, 382	Exhibit H to Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Motion in Limine 3
296	310-9, 383	Exhibit I to Defendants' Memorandum in Exhibit I to Support of Motion in Limine 3
316	323-2, 387	Exhibit 2 to O'Brien Declaration in Support of Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
316	323-13, 398	Exhibit 13 to O'Brien Declaration in Support of Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
316	321, 402	Fox Declaration in Support of Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
324	329-8, 379	Exhibit H to Defendant's Motion to Exclude Frieder

338	341, 420	Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Motion to Exclude Ugone
405	427-19	Exhibit 45 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
425	427-19	Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
		Exhibit 56 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
425	427-29	Exhibit 56 to Plainull's Opposition to
		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
429	439	Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion in
		Limine 1
445	447	Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion in
		Limine 3
445	447-3	Exhibit 3 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion in Limine 3
445	447-4	Exhibit 4 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion in Limine 3
445	447-7	Exhibit 7 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion in Limine 3
445	447-8	Exhibit 8 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
445		Defendants' Motion in Limine 3
445	447-9	Exhibit 9 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
445	447-9	Defendants' Motion in Limine 3
	447.10	Exhibit 10 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
445	447-10	Defendants' Motion in Limine 3
445	447-11	Exhibit 11 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion in Limine 3
449	451	Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion in
		Limine 4
449	451-2	Exhibit 2 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion in Limine 4
453	455	Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion in
		Limine 5
453	455-2	Exhibit 2 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion in Limine 5
457	460	Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion to
		Exclude Becker
457	460-1	Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
457		Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
457	460-4	Exhibit 4 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
437	400-4	Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
AE7	460-11	Exhibit 11 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
457	400-11	Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
4.00		Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion to
462	464	Exclude Frieder
462	464-1	Ex. 1 to Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants'
		Motion to Exclude Frieder
462	464-5	Ex. 5 to Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants'
		Motion to Exclude Frieder

508	511	Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to
		Exclude Ungar
508	512-10	Exhibit 10 to Defendants' Opposition to
•••		Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Ungar
517	522-9	Exhibit I to Ghaussy Declaration in Support of
		Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Second
		Motion for Sanctions
517	522-10	Exhibit J to Ghaussy Declaration in Support of
517		Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Second
		Motion for Sanctions
517	523	Kammerud Declaration in Support of
517		Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Third
		Motion for Sanctions
517	523-1	Exhibit L to Kammerud Declaration in Support
• • •		of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Third
		Motion for Sanctions
517	523-3	Exhibit N to Kammerud Declaration in Support
517		of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Third
		Motion for Sanctions
524	528-1	Exhibit 34 to Defendants' Reply in Support of
		Motion for Summary Judgment
567	568	Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Motion to
		Exclude Ugone

4. Based upon the parties' joint representations that there are no objections, the

following motions to seal are **GRANTED**:

Docket Number of Motion to Be Ruled Upon	Docket Number of Document at Issue	Document Description
280	278-7, 362	Exhibit 7 to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Second motion for Sanctions
289, 368 (Corrected D.N. 285)	283-1, 369	Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Third Motion for Sanctions
289, 368 (Corrected D.N. 285)	283-6, 372	Exhibit 6 to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Third Motion for Sanctions
289, 368 (Corrected D.N. 285)	283-7, 373	Exhibit 7 to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Third Motion for Sanctions
296	310-10, 384	Exhibit J to Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Motion in Limine 3
312	315-3, 416	Exhibit 3 to Plaintiff's Memorandum in Support of Motion in Limine 3
316	320, 385	Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Motion

		to Exclude Becker
316	323-1, 386	Exhibit 1 to O'Brien Declaration in Support of
		Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
324	328, 375	Defendants' Memorandum in Support of Motion
021		to Exclude Frieder
324	329-2, 377	Exhibit B to Defendants' Memorandum in
		Support of Motion to Exclude Frieder
331	334, 417	Plaintiff's Motion in Limine 2
331	334-1, 418	Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine 2
331	334-2, 419	Exhibit 2 to Plaintiff's Motion in Limine 2
338	341-1, 421	Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Ugone
338	341-2, 422	Exhibit 2 to Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Ugone
425	427	Memorandum in Support of Plaintiff's
125		Opposition to Defendant's Motion for Summary
		Judgment
425	427-2	Exhibit 3 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
120		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-2	Exhibit 4 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
725		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-2	Exhibit 5 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
745		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-2	Exhibit 8 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
723	127 -	Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-5	Exhibit 19 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
725		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-5	Exhibit 11 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
725	, .	Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-5	Exhibit 14 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
425		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-5	Exhibit 17 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
723	.2. 0	Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-5	Exhibit 18 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
725	121 0	Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-8	Exhibit 22 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
423		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-8	Exhibit 23 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
425	127 0	Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-8	Exhibit 24 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
423	127 0	Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-11	Exhibit 27 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-11	Exhibit 29 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment
425	427-27	Exhibit 54 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
123		Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment

441	443	Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion in Limine 2
441 441	443-1	Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion in Limine 2
	443-2	Exhibit 2 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
	115 2	Defendants' Motion in Limine 2
449	451-1	Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion in Limine 4
457	460-5	Exhibit 5 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
457	460-7	Exhibit 7 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion to Exclude Becker
462	464-2	Exhibit 2 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
402	404-2	Defendants' Motion to Exclude Frieder
	466	Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to
465	400	Exclude Ugone
	468-4	Exhibit D to Defendants' Opposition to
465	408-4	Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Ugone
	469.5	Exhibit E to Defendants' Opposition to
465	468-5	Plaintiff's Motion to Exclude Ugone
		Exhibit 12 to Declaration of Howard Chen in
508	512-12	
		Support of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's
		Motion to Exclude Ungar
517	522-7	Exhibit G to Ghaussy Declaration in Support of
		Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Second
		Motion for Sanctions
517	521	Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Third
		Motion for Sanctions
517	523-2	Exhibit M to Kammerud Declaration in Support
		of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Third
		Motion for Sanctions
517	523-4	Exhibit O to Kammerud Declaration in Support
		of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Third
		Motion for Sanctions
517	523-5	Exhibit P to Kammerud Declaration in Support
		of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Third
		Motion for Sanctions
517	523-6	Exhibit Q to Kammerud Declaration in Support
		of Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Third
		Motion for Sanctions
524	527	Defendants' Reply in Support of Motion for
		Summary Judgment
561	571-1	Exhibit I to Defendants' Reply in Support of
		Motion to Exclude Frieder
567	569-1	Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's Reply in Support of
		Motion to Exclude Ugone

567	569-2	Exhibit 2 to Plaintiff's Reply in Support of
		Motion to Exclude Ugone
647	651-2	Exhibit 2 to Plaintiff's Reply in Support of Third
		Motion for Sanctions
684	686-1	Exhibit 1 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion to Dismiss Claims against
		AOL, Gannett, IAC, and Target
684	686-4	Exhibit 4 to Plaintiff's Opposition to
		Defendants' Motion to Dismiss Claims against
		AOL, Gannett, IAC, and Target

The Clerk is **DIRECTED** to send a copy of this Order to counsel and parties of record.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Norfolk, Virginia April 4, 2013

Raymond A.Jackson United States District Judge